

Plan for History

To what extent was Mary Queen of Scots a threat during Elizabeth's I reign?

<u>Point</u>	<u>Primary Source</u>	<u>Historian Interpretation</u>
<p>Elizabeth had kept Mary prisoner after her Marriage to Bothwell.</p> <p>(Mary saying, she wouldn't be a problem if she doesn't keep her prisoner)</p>	<p>The Queen of the Scots is and shall always be a dangerous person to your estate. Yet there are degrees of danger. If she is kept a prisoner... it will be less, if at liberty, greater.</p> <p><i>(Sir William Cecil, letter to Queen Elizabeth (16th October 1569)</i></p> <p>http://spartacus-educational.com/TUDelizabeth1.htm</p> <p>I would not thus importune you, but I have something in my head, so that, unless I have a decided answer, I shall have the boldness to set out to come to you, if I am not taken prisoner by your command. Do not ruin me, I beseech you, for it is my wish to devote my life and hear to you for ever. I pray God to prosper you, and give me patience and good counsel against so many wicked inventions of this world. From Bolton this first of September. Your very good and obliged sister and cousin, if you please Mary R.</p> <p><i>The Queen of Scots to Queen Elizabeth, Bolton Castle September 1, 1568.</i></p> <p><i>Letters of Mary Queen of Scots Vol.1</i> <i>By Agnes Strickland New York: the Viking Press</i></p> <p>https://books.google.co.uk/books?vid=OCLC02129193&id=IttUoiwDd5AC&pg=PR3&lpq=PR3&dq=colburn+queen+of+scots&hl=en&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=colburn%20queen%20of%20scots&f=false <i>page 104</i></p>	
<p>Mary wasn't a threat as she was abdicated as Queen</p>		<p>On 24th July she was presented with deeds of abdication, telling her that she would be killed if she did not sign. She eventually agreed to abdicate in favour of her son James. Mary's illegitimate half-brother, James Stewart, 1st Earl of Moray, was made regent. James was crowned as a protestant,</p>

		<p>still only thirteen months old, on 29th July, 1567, at Stirling parish church. The sermon at the coronation was preached by John Knox. In accordance with the religious beliefs of most of the Scottish ruling class, James was brought up as a member of the Protestant Church of Scotland.</p> <p>Jenny Wormald, King James I: Oxford Dictional of National Biography (2004-2014)</p>
<p>Mary was a threat to Elizabeth because she had plots to kill her.</p>	<p>We... will undertake the delivery of your royal persons from the hands of your enemies... For the dispatch of the usurper (Elizabeth)... six noble gentlemen, who, for the zeal they have to the Catholic cause... will undertake that tragical execution.</p> <p>Letter sent by Anthony Babington to Mary Stuart (July 1586) http://spartacus-educational.com/TUDmaryscots.htm</p> <p>There is a letter from the Scottish Queen, that hath wrought tears... the delay (in executing Mary) is too dangerous.</p> <p>Letters from the Earl of Leicester to Francis Walsingham describing Elizabeth's response to Mary's letter asking to be spared (December 1586).</p>	<p>Mary was a threat to Elizabeth because she was seen as a stable leader. Antonia Fraser examination of Mary's reign was that Mary's reign was relatively positive, she refrains from attributing to Mary any characteristic which doesn't embody femininity thus, undercutting Mary's capable, calculating and political mind.</p> <p>Fraser, Antonia. Mary, Queen of Scots. New York: Delacorte Press, 1969. http://www.d.umn.edu/cla/faculty/tbacig/studproj/h3099/maryscots/mary%20site,%20seminar%20paper.htm</p> <p>While Mary was in England, plot after plot was made against Elizabeth by Mary's friends, and by men who looked to her as their rightful queen. Whether Mary knew of these plots in uncertain... Letters were found... but there were many who said then, and many who still believe, that these letters were forgeries- that is to say, that they were written by Mary's enemies for the purpose of making people believe that she was guilty.</p> <p>Hugh Oakeley Arnold- Forster, History of England (1898). http://spartacus-educational.com/TUDmaryscots.htm</p> <p>In November 1583, Walsingham ordered the arrest of Throckmorton in his London home. He just had time to destroy a letter he was in the act of writing to Mary Queen of Scots, but among his seized papers was a list of the names of "certain Catholic noblemen and gentlemen" and also details of harbours "suitable for landing foreign forces". At first Throckmorton denied they were his, saying they must have been planted by the government searchers. He later admitted that they had been given to him by a man named Nutby who had recently left the country</p>

		<i>Alison Plowden, Oxford Dictionary of National Biography (2004-2014).</i>
Mary wasn't a threat to Elizabeth as she was had the power to sentence her to death.	<p>Then, her dress of lawn (i.e. wig) from off her head, it appeared as grey as one of threescore and ten years old, polled very short, her face in a moment being so much altered from the form she had when she was love, as few could remember her by her dead face. Her lips stirred up and down a quarter of an hour after her head was cut off.</p> <p><i>The Execution of Mary Queen of Scots 8th February, Robert Wynkfield</i> https://tudorhistory.org/primary/exmary.html</p> <p>To the most Christian king, my brother and old ally, Royal brother, having by God's will, for my sins I think, thrown myself into the power of the Queen my cousin, at whose hands I have suffered much for almost twenty years, I have finally been condemned to death by her and her Estates. I have asked for my papers, which they have taken away, in order that I might make my will, but I have been unable to recover anything of use to me, or even get leave either to make my will freely or to have my body conveyed after my death, as I would wish, to your kingdom where I had the honor to be queen, your sister and old ally.</p> <p><i>Letter from Mary Queen of Scots to King Henry III, written on 8th February 1587.</i> <i>(Her last letter)</i> https://englishhistory.net/tudor/mary-queen-scots-last-letter/</p>	
Mary was a threat because of the murder of her husband lord Darnley who she was associated with the murder.	<p>Madam, My ears have been astounded and my heart so frightened to hear of the horrible and abominable murder of your husband and my own cousin that I have scarcely sprit to write: yet I cannot conceal that I have grieve more for you than him. I should not do the office of a faithful cousin and friend, if I did not urge you to preserve you honour, rather than look through your fingers at revenge on those who have done you pleasure at most people say. I counsel you so to take this matter to heart, that you may show the world what a noble Princess and loyal women you are. I write thus vehemently not that I doubt but for affection.</p> <p><i>Elizabeth I to Mary Queen of Scots 24th February.</i></p>	<p>An even greater illustration of Zweig's romantic view can be seen in his comparison of Mary and her relationship with Darnley and then Bothwell with that of Romeo and Rosaline, and then with Juliet. Additionally Zweig continues by speculation about Mary's sexual feelings towards all free of her husband concluding that Bothwell was by far the most exciting and satisfying.</p> <p><i>Zweig, Stefan. Mary Queen of Scotland and the Isle. Trans. Eden and Cedar Paul</i> http://www.d.umn.edu/cla/faculty/tbacig/studpr oj/h3099/maryscots/mary%20site,%20seminar%20paper.htm</p>

	<p>http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/education/resources/elizabeth-monarchy/elizabeth-i-to-mary-queen-of-scots-february-1567</p>	
<p>Mary wasn't a threat because she did not have the support of her son James VI</p>	<p>My dear Brother, I would you knew (though not felt) the extreme dolor that overwhelms my mind, for that miserable accident which (far contrary to my meaning) hath befallen. I have now sent this kinsman of mine, whom ere now it hath pleased you to favour, to instruct you truly of that which is too irksome for my pen to tell you. I beseech you that as God and many more know, how innocent I am in this case : so you will believe me, that if I had bid aught I would have bid by it. I am not so base minded that fear of any living creature or Prince should make me so afraid to do that were just; or done, to deny the same. I am not of so base a lineage, nor carry so vile a mind. But, as not to disguise, fits not a King, so will I never dissemble my actions, but cause them show even as I meant them. Thus assuring yourself of me, that as I know this was deserved, yet if I had meant it I would never lay it on others' shoulders; no more will I not damnify myself that thought it not.</p> <p>The circumstance it may please you to have of this bearer. And for your part, think you have not in the world a more loving kinswoman, nor a more dear friend than myself; nor any that will watch more carefully to preserve you and your estate. And who shall otherwise persuade you, judge them more partial to others than you. And thus in haste I leave to trouble you: beseeching God to send you a long reign.</p> <p>Your most assured loving sister and cousin, Elizabeth R.</p> <p><i>A letter from Elizabeth to James VI of Scotland 14th February 1587</i> https://englishhistory.net/tudor/execution-mary-queen-scots-1587-letters/</p>	<p>Mary, he decided, was responsible for her husband's death. Consequently, in both the schoolroom and in print she became a 'bloody women and poisoning witch', whose 'immeasurable but mad' love for Bothwell justified her deposition. Filthy stories about the Queen, scraped from the tap-rooms of Edinburgh taverns, became the stock-in trade of Buchanan's teaching method. The boy's reaction to this sour and relentless onslaught against his mother was ambivalent and must have caused him pain. He fiercely rejects tales of Mary's immorality and eventually turned on her traducers. But he could not easier deny Buchanan's version of events that led to her abdication: both his office and title of King were dependent on it. He also kept a politics silence. The ambivalence of James feelings for his mother was dramatically exposed in 1586-1587 when Mary was found guilty by an English Court of conspiring with Antony Babington to murder Elizabeth. When news of his mother alleged part in the conspiracy to murder Elizabeth that Mary 'just be content to drink of all she has brewed.'</p> <p><i>S.J Houston (1995). James I. 2nd ed. New York : Routledge . 4.</i></p> <p>https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=P12PBAAAQBAJ&printsec=frontcover&dq=james+i&hl=en&sa=X&ved=0ahUKEwiZmN-kipzdAhXrAcAKHUKEBMwQ6AEINzAC#v=onepage&q=james%20i&f=false</p> <p>As it turned out James in Scotland had already enjoyed a taste of power, and he did not want Mary returned to Scotland, where he would have the problem of deciding what to do with his mother.</p> <p><i>Why did Elizabeth I hesitate when signing the death warrant of Mary Queen of Scots- Robert Stedall.</i> http://www.maryqueenofscots.net/why-did-elizabeth-i-hesitate-when-signing-the-death-warrant-of-mary-queen-of-scots/</p>
<p>Mary was a threat to Elizabeth because of</p>	<p>[Draft by Lord Burghley] Madame, it hath bene allwise held for a special principle in friendship, that prosperitie provideth but adversite proveth frendes, wherof at this tyme fyndyng occasion to verify the</p>	

<p>the reputation she would have got from marrying Bothwell after her marriage to Darnley.</p>	<p>same with our actions, we have thought mete both for our profession and your comefort in these few words, to testify our friendship not only by admonyshyng of your worst but to comfort you for your best. We have understood by your trusty servant Robert Melvill such thyngs as yow gave hym in chardg to declare on your behalf concerning your estate and specially of as much as should be sayd for ye allowance of your mariadg. Madam, to be playne with you our greef hath not bene small that in this mariadg so slender consideration hath bene had that, as we perceave manifestly no good frend you have in ye whole world can lyke thereof, and if we shuld otherwise wryte or saye we shuld abuse you. For how cold a worse choise be made for your honour than in such hast to marry such a subject who besides other notorious lackes publick fame has chargyd with the murdre of your late husband, beside ye touchyng of your self also in some part, though we trust in that behalf falsely. And with what perill have you married hym that hath an other lawfull wyfe a lyve, whereby neither by God's law nor man's your selff can be his lawfull wiff [wife], nor any children betwixt you legitimate. Thus you see playnely what we thynk of the mariadg wherof we ar hartely sorry that we can conceive no better, what collourable reasons so ever we have hard of your servant to induce us therein. We wish uppon ye deth of your husband that first care had been to have serched out and punished ye murderers of our neare coosyn, your husband, which having bene doone effectually, as easily it might have bene in a matter so notorious, ther myght have bene many more thyngs tollerated better in your mariadg than now can be suffered to be spoken of. And surely we can not but for friendshipp to your self, besides ye natural instynction that we have of blood to your late husband, profess our selves earnestly bent to doo any thyng in our power to procure ye dew punishment of that murdre agaynst any subject that you have, how deare so ever you should hold hym, and next thereto, to be carefull how your sonne ye prynce may be preserved for ye comfort of yours and your realme. Which two thynges we have from ye begyning allwise taken to hart, and therin doo meane to contynew, and wold be very sorry but you shuld allow us therin, what dangerous perswasions so ever be made to you for ye contrary. Now for your Estat in such adversitie as we here you shuld be wherof we [know?] not well what to think to be how having a great part of your Nobilitie as we here separated from yow, we assure you that what so ever we can imagyn mete for your honor and surety that shall lye in our power, we will perform the same</p>	
--	--	--

	<p>that it shall and will appear you have a good neighbour, a deare sistar and a faythfull frend, and so shall you undoubtedly allweise fynd and prove us to be in dede towards yow. For which purpose we ar determyned to send with all spede on [one] of our owne trusty servants, not only to understand your state but also thereuppon so to deale with your Nobility and people, as they shall fynd yow not to lack our friendship and power for ye preservacyon of honor in quyetness. And upon knolledg had what shall be furder ryght to be done for your comfort and for ye tranquilitie of your realme we will omytt no tyme to furder ye same as yow shall and will see. And so we recommend ourselves to you good sistar in as affectionate a manner as heretofor we war accustomed. At our manor of Rychmond ye 23 of June 1567.</p> <p>Elizabeth I to Mary, Queen of Scots, 23 June 1567 (SP 52/13 f.71) (The National Archives)</p>	
<p>Mary was also a threat because of the different background that her and Elizabeth had.</p>		<p>Jenny Wormald’s study of Mary’s reign is centred directly on Mary’s personal rule. The main positive aspect of the book is Wormald’s reliance on studying Mary as one would study any male rule of the same time. The major problem with this view is the lack of understanding of Mary’s upbringing and her connection with her femininity. I think Wormald used the ‘masculine’ model of Elizabeth I to argue Mary should have been in order to be successful; however Mary and Elizbeth had two very different background, up bringing’s and values as well as two very different countries with different stages of political development.</p> <p>http://www.d.umn.edu/cla/faculty/tbacig/studpr oj/h3099/maryscots/mary%20site,%20seminar%20paper.htm</p> <p>Wormald, Jenny. Mary Queen of Scots: A Study in Failure. London: George Philip 1988</p>
<p>Mary wasn’t a threat to Elizabeth as she was a weak monarch.</p>		<p>Buchanan’s translator states,</p> <p>His Dejure regni apud Scotos was written to provide, among other things, a theoretical justification for the rebellion of the Scots lords against Mary; he wrote his Detectio to prove her guilt in the murder of Darnley; and he eventually wrote the complete History of Scotland, the Rerum Scoticarum Historia, the grand climax of which purported to show that throughout her personal reign Mary had schemed to establish a tyranny, had</p>

		<p>behaved recklessly and maliciously at all times, and had ultimately devised the murder of her husband at the hands of her paramour.</p> <p>http://www.d.umn.edu/cla/faculty/tbacig/studpr oj/h3099/marjscots/mary%20site,%20seminar%20paper.htm</p> <p>Buchanan, George. <i>The Tyrannous Reign of Mary Stewart Trans. W.A Gatherer Edinburgh University Press 1959.</i></p> <p>Where she went disastrously wrong was allowing in Bothwell, still a married man, to seduce her at Dunbar. Her worse mistake was allow herself a Queen to fall in love.</p> <p>Assesment of Mary's Character: an extract from <i>My Heart is My Own.</i>" John Guy.</p> <p>http://www.johnguy.co.uk/my-heart-is-my-own-john-guy-assessment-of-mary.php</p>
<p>Mary wanted peace with Elizabeth</p>		<p>The reappeared on the 18th when Mary repeated her desire for amity. She and Elizabeth started to say were two Queens in One Isle, of one language. Chapter returns to Scotland.</p> <p>John Guy <i>My heart is my own chapter return to Scotland</i></p>
<p>Mary's marriage to Lord Darnley threatened Elizabeth as they both had claim to the throne.</p>		<p>Elizabeth was totally against the match because it would unite two claims on the throne. Any children of the marriage would inherit an even stronger, combined claim. At first Elizabeth was confident that she would block it because Darnley was an English subject, and his parents were her dependants with lands in England.</p> <p>Julian Goodare, <i>Mary Queen of Scots: Oxford Dictionary of National Biography 2004-2014</i></p>
<p>Elizabeth's religion meant that people were against her.</p>	<p>Elizabeth, Queen of England... is the servant of wickedness... This woman, having seized the kingdom of England and... has reduced it into a miserable and ruinous condition.</p> <p>In 1570 Pope V issued a statement about Queen Elizabeth</p>	<p>Elizabeth nearly succeeded in her policy of avoiding conflict at home and abroad, or deflecting it from herself when it was unavoidable. But as the European atmosphere worsened, some in England and abroad hoped for the death of Elizabeth would open a path to the throne for the Catholic Mary Queen of Scots. So in 1570, Pope Pius V denounced "that servant of all iniquity, Elizabeth, pretended Queen of England. With whom, as in a most secure place, all the worst kind of men find a refuge." He</p>

		<p>declared that “the aforesaid Elizabeth is a heretic and a favourer of heretics... and that she is wholly deprived of her pretended right to aforesaid kingdom.”³⁰. The papal bull was a document that served both extremes. For those who opposed Elizabeth to the death, it was an open call for her assassination.</p>
--	--	--

Page 59 Clark Hulse- Elizabeth Ruler and Legend.

England 1547-1603: The Later Tudors

To what extent was Mary Queen of Scots a threat during Elizabeth's I reign?

Reasons to why she wasn't

- Elizabeth had kept her prisoner after her marriage to Bothwell.
- That James wasn't helping her
- She said that she wasn't involved in the Babington Plot.
- The relationship that she and Elizabeth had
- Because she gave up the throne to her son James after she was arrested and held prisoner at Lochleven Castle.
- Most people found it absurd that Elizabeth wouldn't have been seen a illegitimate to the throne.
- The fact that Elizabeth signed her warrant to execute her

Reasons to why she was

- Mary, Queen of Scots threatened the religious stability. As she was a Catholic, she might become a focus for all the Catholics who existed in England and a leader for them. This made Mary a very real threat to Elizabeth.
- There were some who believed that the marriage between Henry VIII and Anne Boleyn had been illegal. Catholics did not recognise Henry's divorce from the Catholic Catherine of Aragon as true. If Elizabeth was illegitimate then the next legal heir to the throne was Mary, Queen of Scots.
- Because Mary was seen as more attractive than Elizabeth was
- The Babington plots and rebellions.
- Elizabeth wasn't sure whether or not to sign the warrant, meaning it was a loss, loss situation for her.
- The fact that Mary was Catholic so would have gained the support from the Catholic people.
- Queen Elizabeth was totally against the match of Mary Queen of Scots because it would unite two claims on the throne. Any children of the marriage would inherit an even stronger combined claim. Lord Darnley and Mary were grandchildren of Margaret Tudor, sister of Henry VIII of England, and the widow of James IV, King of Scots.

Historians that could be used

- John Guy (My heart is my own: the life of Mary Queen of Scots)
- John Guy (Queen of Scots: The True Life of Mary Stuart. *This can be used against the argument.*)
- Antonia Fraser (Mary Queen of Scots)
- Marjorie Bowen (Mary Queen of Scots)
- Alison Weir (Mary Queen of Scots) and the murder of Lord Darnley
- Robert Stedall (Mary Queen of Scots Down fall: The Life and Murder of Henry, Lord Darnley.)
- Jenny Wormald (Mary Queen of Scots) Politics, Passion and a Kingdom Lost.
- Alison Plowden (Two Queens in One Isle)
- After Elizabeth (The rise of James of Scotland and the Struggle for the Throne of England)
- James Mackay (Mary Queen of Scots: In My End is my Beginning.)

Main themes

Religion

Marriage

Plots

Reputation

Structure of Essay

Introduction- Overview of Mary and Elizabeth's relationship the rivalry between the two Queens.

Point 1 - Mary was known for her looks compared to Elizabeth who was not so Mary could be seen as a threat because of her beauty.

Point 2 - When Mary came back from France she wanted to rule aside Elizabeth and didn't want to cause a problem and The Treaty of Edinburgh had been signed before with King Francis (Mary's late husband).

Point-3 Mary and Elizabeth at the beginning ruled well together and seemed to have a good relationship, such as writing letters to one and another. Elizabeth also had Mary's brother who was the illegitimate son of Mary's father.

Point 4 - Mary's marriage to Lord Darnley proposed a threat to Elizabeth as Darnley had a connection to the throne which meant their marriage made them more compatible to the throne.

Point 5- When Mary married Darnley and then was supposedly involved in his murder this could be a threat to Elizabeth as it could impact the reputation of female monarchs and make them seem like a weak leader.

Point 6- Mary's marriage to Bothwell was very unpopular which led to rebellion from the Scottish people, this could be argued as a threat to Elizabeth as again damaging the reputation of female monarchs. However, at the same time could be argued that it wasn't a threat as the more people than grew to dislike Mary meant she had less support, so she was less of a worry.

Point 7- Mary became vulnerable when she was removed from the Queen of Scotland and relied on Elizabeth for help. Elizabeth took control of this power and made Mary a prisoner so that she had control over her.

Point 8- Elizabeth had the support for Mary's son who became the King of Scotland as he was against his mother returning to Scotland to become Queen.

Point 9 - Elizabeth was criticised by many people for being a protestant and people wanted a Catholic monarch. There were people who wanted to overthrow Elizabeth and put Mary on the throne.

Link together by how a lot of these views resulted in plots to try and assassinate Elizabeth and put Mary on the throne.

Point 10- The Babington plot and the Throckmoroton plot and then extent to which they threatened Elizabeth's reign such as her attempted assassination. How Mary had support even when she was kept prisoner.

Point 11- The extent to which these plots weren't a threat to Elizabeth. Such as the fact they were able to stop and arrest people that were involved to prevent her being overthrown and assassinated.

Link together with stopping the plots which resulted in the execution of Mary Queen of Scots

Point 12 - Elizabeth wasn't sure whether or not to sign the warrant, as it was a loss situation, as it may affect Elizabeth's reputation if she was involved in the death of another monarch.

Point 13 - Elizabeth warranted Mary's execution showing that she had power over Mary.

Conclusion.